

literally exotic species) as to the position occupied by the bird when it enters: not in the orchestra, as might have been expected,⁴ but on the roof of the *skene*. The Mede is indeed occupying an "out-of-place spot."⁵ Likewise the Aeschylean quotation⁶ in 276 is remodeled to meet the needs of the occasion: *ἄτοπος* covers both the foreign extraction of the bird and its unexpected perch—it is *literally* *ἄτοπος*—and *δρειβάτης* points to the fact that the bird is in an elevated position.

ALAN S. HENRY
Monash University

4. The audience cannot as yet be certain that this bird is not a *choreutes*.

5. Cf. the parallel use of *ἐκτοπος* in 1474 (*δένδρον πεφυκὸς ἐκτοπὸν τι*), where the Cleonymus-tree is literally "out of the way" as well as "strange," "extraordinary."

6. From the *Edonians* (frag. 75 Mette). Whatever the complete text of the original, it probably included *ἄλαλος* and *ἀβροβάτης*. Aristophanes substitutes *ἄτοπος* and *δρειβάτης* (pace H. Weir Smyth, ed., *Aeschylus*, Loeb Classical Library, vol. 2 [London, 1926], p. 401, who appears to accept *ἀβροβάτης* in the text of Aristophanes).

THE STUDENT-TEACHER TOPOS IN BIOGRAPHICAL FICTION: GILBERT MURRAY AND ULRICH VON WILAMOWITZ-MOELLENDORFF

Chronological relationships between writers could be stressed by an account of a meeting between two leading representatives of the same genre, where one was well on his career and the other still young. . . . One might go a step further than this, and make the younger of a pair of famous men the pupil of the elder. [J. A. Fairweather, "Fiction in the Biographies of Ancient Writers," *Ancient Society* 5 (1974): 261, 262]

[Gilbert Murray] took advantage of his leisure to study for a short time in Germany under the magnificent Hellenist, Ulrich von Wilamowitz-Moellendorf. Wilamowitz records¹ that he received a letter from Murray "in elegant Attic," and Murray used to recall that, when he himself got right what the German students got wrong, the great man would bang the table and snort indignantly: "Only the Englishmen!" [C. M. Bowra, "Gilbert Murray," *Atlantic Monthly*, May 1958, p. 72]²

Wilamowitz said that a scholar should be resigned to the transitory life of his productions, and that was certainly the attitude of his friend and pupil, Gilbert Murray. . . . As a young man he wrote to Wilamowitz and went to study under him. [Hugh Lloyd-Jones, *Greek Studies in Modern Oxford: An Inaugural Address* (Oxford, 1961), pp. 12, 14]

[Gilbert Murray] had used his years of leisure to real profit. He went to study Greek in Berlin with the magnificent Hellenist, Ulrich von Wilamowitz-Moellendorf, who records that he received a letter from Murray in "elegant Attic," and Murray used to recall that when the German students made mistakes and the English (presumably himself) got it right, the great man would bang the table and cry, "Nur die Engländer!" (Only the English!).³ [C. M. Bowra, *Memories 1898-1938* (Cambridge, Mass., 1967), p. 216]

1. *Erinnerungen 1848-1914*² (Leipzig, 1929), p. 228: "einen Brief in elegantem Attisch."

2. We owe this reference to Professor Francis West, the biographer of Murray.

3. This latter version carefully distinguishes between Murray's story and Bowra's interpretation. *Recentiores, non deteriores*.

From Wilamowitz' letters to Murray in the Bodleian, it is quite clear that they had never met before Wilamowitz went to Oxford in 1908. When Murray was in Italy in February and March 1903, Wilamowitz was at a conference in Rome but did not know of Murray's presence and regretted that they hadn't met. When Wilamowitz was going to Oxford in 1908 he wrote to Murray saying he looked forward to meeting him personally. . . . I think the origin of this error . . . is probably that when Murray was elected to a Fellowship at New College Oxford in 1888 he expressed the intention of going to Wilamowitz' seminar in Göttingen⁴ but he never actually did so;⁵ indeed, to my knowledge he never visited Germany. The story of Wilamowitz' thumping the table and saying to his class "only the Englishman, by God" I think relates to one of Murray's pupils who did attend one of the seminars, and Bowra has misunderstood this to mean Murray himself. [Francis West, per litt., 15 October 1975]⁶

[Wilamowitz] had many English friends and showed an appreciation, rare on the continent, for English scholarship. In one of his Seminars, if the class boggled in translating some difficult text, he would turn to the few English students, mostly senior men, who could generally do it. Then came an indignant "Nur die Engländer!" [G. Murray, "Wilamowitz," *CR* 45 (1931): 162]

WILLIAM M. CALDER III
E. CHRISTIAN KOPFF
University of Colorado

4. Where Latin was written and spoken: Edward Fitch, *Hamilton Literary Monthly* 29 (1894): 106.

5. At *Erinnerungen*², p. 312, where he discusses Murray, Wilamowitz describes the visit of B. L. Gildersleeve to one of his lectures. The coincidence may have encouraged confusion. Neither Wilamowitz in his account of his friendship with Murray (*Erinnerungen*², pp. 228, 312) nor Murray in his account of his friendship with Wilamowitz ("Memories of Wilamowitz," *A & A* 4 [1954]: 9-14) alludes to Murray's participation in any class of Wilamowitz.

6. We are grateful to Professor West for permission to quote his view.